

KALAMAZOO HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Agenda – Tuesday, August 15th, 2023

5:00 pm

241 W. South St. Kalamazoo, MI 49007

I. Call to Order: Ms. Underwood called the meeting to order at 5:03 PM

II. Roll Call & Approval of Absences:

Eric Stucky-Absent

Andrew Grayson- Present

Dana Underwood – Present

Kristi Breisach- Present

James Johnson-Present

Dan Kastner- Absent

Motion made by Ms. Breisach to approve the 2 absences with a 2nd by Mr. Greyson; all commissioners approve.

III. Approval of Agenda: Ms. Underwood added to the agenda - commissioner comments.

Motion made to approve the changes to the agenda by Mr. Johnson and a 2nd by Mr. Greyson; all commissioners approve.

IV. Approval of Minutes: July 18, 2023.

No changes to the minutes. Motion made by Mr. Greyson to approve the minutes with a second by Ms. Breisach; All commissioners approve the minutes.

V. Public Comment on non-agenda items: None

VI. OLD BUSINESS: None

NEW BUSINESS:

A) 1207 W Lovell

5:06 PM

Alteration – Siding, door to window changes, new door, new rear steps

Year Built: 1911

Style: Colonial Revival

Historic District: West Main Hill

Ms. Laura Strong is the current owner of the home. The owner recently removed a portion of the rear of the house. Once the rear portion of the house was removed the owner realized that it does have the original siding on the top half of the house and is planning to scrape and paint to match to the original. The bottom half does not match the remainder of the home and Ms. Strong is looking to use a beveled edge wood siding that matches what'd already on the top of the back of the house and will all be painted the same blue to match the rest of the house. The front of the house on the bottom and the sides are stucco and the tops of the house are fish scale. The previous addition that was torn down had cedar shake. The rear of the house would still have stucco on the outside edges after the siding. Mr. Greyson makes motion to approve the siding on the rear of the structure as the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2 and 9 with a second by Mr. Johnson. All commissioners approve.

Ms. Strong is also looking to do some work regarding the windows. The upstairs window which goes to a bedroom wants to remove the door and replace with a window. On the main floor they want to replace the current door with a window. The original windows were vinyl and that is also what they are looking to put in. The existing window that is being kept is also vinyl. Mr. Johnson was curious when the house went to vinyl windows, which was a year before it became part of the historic district. Mr. Johnson makes motion to approve the windows on the rear of the structure as the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2 and 9 with a second by Mr. Greyson. All commissioners approve.

Ms. Strong is also looking to replace the interior door with a steel exterior door. Is unable to use the original door since it was an interior hollow door. Mr. Johnson makes motion to approve the door on the rear of the structure as the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2 and 9 with a second by Mr. Greyson. All commissioners approve.

The final repairs by Ms. Strong are to add 2-3 steps with a railing that is up to the city code for rentals with spindles. The spindles will closely match what is on the front of the house. Mr. Johnson makes motion to approve the steps on the rear of the structure as the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2 and 9 with a second by Ms. Breisach. All commissioners approve. Mr. Johnson makes motion to approve the removal of the chimney as the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2 and 6 with a second by Ms. Breisach. All commissioners approve.

B)	504 S Westnedge Year Built: 1927	5:19 PM	Alteration (lower chimney) Style: Gothic Revival Historic District: South St – Vine Area
-----------	---	----------------	---

Mr. Blair Bates from Building Restoration. The current chimney is original to the building, but it is ineffective and its no longer in use and they would like to take it down to about 2 foot above the roof line. They are looking to use the brick that is removed from the chimney to repair other areas since the brick itself is no longer manufactured. Ms. Underwood does not feel that the chimney is a character defining feature. The existing chimney is approximately 18 feet. Mr. Johnson makes motion to approve the removal of the chimney as the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2 and 6 with a second by Ms. Breisach. All commissioners approve.

C)	111 Portage Year Built: 1924	5:22 PM	Alteration – Installation of Signs Style: Commercial Historic District: Haymarket
-----------	---	----------------	--

Brandon with Sign Impressions is proposing to install a new sign for Saugatuck Brewing Company. Would be 36x36 double sided sign aluminum and will be flag mounted to the building and either attached to the side of the building or on the second level of the brick in the mortar joints. Mr Johnson makes motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as described in the application,

the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 9 and 10 with a second by Ms. Breisach. All commissioners approve.

D)	1475 S Main	5:25 PM	Alteration- Window replacement, window Enlargement, door replacement, removal of porch enclosure Style: Craftsman Historic District: West Main Hill
	Year Built: 1915		

Angie Polderman with PCW Design Build is presenting for the home on West Main that sustained a fire. The main rooms that were impacted were the porch, dining room and living room. The first item to consider is the porch. The porch was previously enclosed with a sliding door as the front door. The homeowners are looking to reopen the front porch and are wanting to reuse and keep in place the original porch rails that were found after the fire. Ms. Breisach makes motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to retore the porch to an open porch by removing walls and restoring existing railings, he proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2, 6 and 9 with a second by Mr. Grayson. All commissioners approve.

Ms. Polderman is also looking to address the dining room windows that were destroyed. They are wanting to install an Anderson Fibrex unit that is part composite and part wood. Fibrex is stronger than vinyl and can be painted. These windows would still have the same configuration and would still have same French casement and awing as well as the grids on the windows. Fibrex is a man made material and wont patina unless it is painted and does have a quicker lead time then wood windows. No information currently about how the windows settle in comparison to wood. They will be doing any additional framing to reinforce the framing with the new windows as everything is down to the studs. The house does have mix of wood windows and vinyl and will be saving some wood windows. Mr. Johnson makes motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to use 5 Fibrex windows, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2, 6 and 9 and final details delegates to historic preservation coordinator with a second by Mr. Grayson. All commissioners approve.

Ms. Polderman also states that the homeowners are looking to balance the windows on the sides of the fireplace. The bookcase that was in the home below the smaller window was damaged in the fire. They are wanting to have both windows match in height to bring some symmetry to the home. The character defining feature in these kinds of homes is symmetry which would be more in line per the standards. Mr. Johnson makes motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as described in the application to enlarge the window to create symmetry as a character defining feature, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2, 6 and 9, with a second by Mr. Grayson. All commissioners approve.

The final portion of the application is to replace the entry door to the home. This door is not on the front of the home it is on the side and was demolished by the fire. They are proposing to install a craftsman style home that is fiberglass. Ms. Breisach makes motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as described in the

application to approve the new fiberglass front door, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards 1, 2, 6 and 9, with a second by Mr. Johnson. All commissioners approve.

E)	930 W Kalamazoo	5:53 PM	Alteration – Installation of vinyl siding to the home, covering up existing wood siding
	Year Built: 1888		Style: Queen Anne
			Historic District: Stuart

Below is a summary that was provided by the homeowner Jeanne stating what has been done to her home over the years regarding painting and repairing the exterior of her home.

I am requesting permission to have my house vinyl sided using the best possible siding and siding installer. The reason for this is that I cannot find a way to get paint to hold on the existing [original] siding. I have paid to have the house professionally repainted twice in the last 20 years and both times, the paint started “popping” off within one to two years of painting. Last summer (2022) I hired a third painting company to repaint my house. They power washed it; let it dry for three weeks; scraped it; and then walked off the job when I asked them to do a better job of scraping before they continued to prime. Just a few weeks ago, I walked outside and saw that the paint in an area of smooth paint which appeared to not need scraping had started “popping” off.

I recently requested two exceptional paint companies – Van Tuinen and PMV Custom Finishes – to provide me with a quote to scrape, sand and repaint the house. I chose those companies because of their reputation for quality, their 5-year guarantee, and the professionalism of their companies. Van Tuinen refused to bid on the house – said that they could not guarantee it and they do not bid on houses they can’t guarantee. PMV provided a \$64,275 bid which includes intensive scraping (by hand and mechanical) and sanding but the owner told me they could not provide their normal 5-year guarantee because they are not confident the paint will hold.

Based on the last 25 years of paint not sticking to the house combined with the bleak evaluations by Van Tuinen and PMV, I am now looking at the possibility of high-quality vinyl siding that perfectly matches the original look of the house. I am currently talking with a siding contractor in Grand Rapids who has extensive experience installing vinyl siding on historic homes in Grand Rapids. However, I will get at least one more proposal from another company experienced in siding historic homes. It’s likely that the project could not start until next spring.

- 1992 -The previous owner (Dwight Kelter) had the house painted in preparation for selling. He used discontinued automobile paint. The painter he hired advised Dwight not to use auto paint but Dwight had already purchased 5-gallon drums at a greatly discounted rate.
- 1993 -My husband and I bought the house.
- 1996 -By 1996, there was extensive paint cracking and peeling all over the house. I met with Jim Van Tuinen (Van Tuinen Painting) to discuss options for restoring the exterior paint so that it would be smooth and look like new. Mr. Van Tuinen suggested that, if that was my goal, I should consider hiring an individual painter who could spend the entire summer removing the old paint and then repainting. So that's what I did. We hired an individual painter who suggested that he could eliminate the "alligator" look of the siding by using exterior caulk to smooth out all the edges where paint had peeled away. This seemed like a good idea so the painter spent the entire summer scraping away all the loose paint; caulking virtually every board to eliminate the alligator look; and then sanding the caulk to create a perfectly smooth surface. He painted the house with Benjamin Moore oil primer and topped it with Benjamin Moore latex paint. We also had a restoration company replicate the original design of the front porch and produce all new porch posts and spindles (the original wood had extensive rotting). The result was beautiful!
- 1997 -By the following summer, several spots on the newly painted siding started to "pop" and/or peel. By the summer after that, it was so bad that painters started stopping by to drop off their business cards and offer their services to repaint our house. We ended up hiring Richard Modras (Signature Painters) to scrape and repaint the house. They did a nice job. Richard said that many of the spots they scraped had a white gooey substance underneath. I guessed it must be the caulk.
- 1998-By the following summer, the newly painted siding was, once again, popping and peeling. At that point, we did not know what to do so we decided to just wait it out, hoping that the spots that were going to peel would peel off and then we could start all over again. Every year, more painted areas popped open. In 2008, my husband and I divorced and I took sole ownership of the house.
- 2007-08 - I had three major traumas in 2007-2008. My business did not survive the recession, my husband and I divorced, and my father came to live with me because he needed 24/7 care.
- Unknown Year- I invited Sharon Ferraro over to look at my house and see if she could come up

with any solution to the paint problem and if there was any grant funding to help. She put out a mass request to her colleagues in the restoration field to see if anyone had any ideas. She was not able to come up with a viable option that could be relied upon to solve the problem. Consequently, I was no longer in a position to pay for a full restoration of the painting – even if a solution were found (which it wasn't).

- 2021- After my father passed away in 2016, I started a one-guest B&B; then returned to my career in 2020. In the spring of 2021, I solicited bids from multiple painting companies to repaint the house. I ended up selecting Steve Doud of A-Plus Painting because he assured me that he would attend to every detail and do an exceptional job. His internet reviews were all good. To prepare, I hired a carpenter who repaired and replaced all the broken or rotted wood. Like every other painting company I contacted, A-Plus was not able to paint my house until the following summer (2022) due to COVID and the shortage of workers. Consequently, I had to wait another year.

- 2022- A-Plus started on my house in early spring of 2022. They power washed it and then let it sit to dry for 3-4 weeks. Then they came back to scrape and prep. I was working in Colorado at the time, frequently flying back to check on the house. After the prep was done, I flew home to check, only to find that they had started spraying primer on the house (without my permission) right on top of unfinished scraping and no sanding whatsoever. I called the owner (Steve Doud) immediately to ask if he planned to scrape and sand after the priming. He became irate, told me I had no right to tell him how to do his job; then said he was coming over to pick up his equipment – refusing to return \$8000 of my deposit and leaving the house in worse condition than before they started. I contacted the other painters I had received bids from but no one could do the job until the following summer (2023). I asked Luis Pena to come over so that he could assess the situation and the additional damage done by A-Plus Painting.

- 2023-After the first of this year, I started contacting painters to repaint the house this summer (2023). By this point, I was only willing to work with a well-established, reputable and insured company who provided a minimum 5-year guarantee. That search resulted in two companies – Van Tuinen and PMV Custom Finishes. Nick at Van Tuinen Painting said they would not bid on the job because they could not guarantee it and they do not do jobs they can't guarantee. Phil, the owner of PMV, provided a bid (\$64,275) which included removal of all the loosening paint, sanding, and repair of all the rough spots – but he will not guarantee the job due to the history of previous paint jobs failing.

- 5/2023- Last month, I contacted a siding company in Kalamazoo and their

representative came out to look at the house along with Luis Pena to assess the situation. At that time, Luis explained the process for requesting permission for an exception from the Historic Commission. Shortly after their visit, I saw that another area of the painted siding had popped out. This “pop” just happened several weeks ago, and is a continuation of what has been happening since

- 6/2023 - I have been researching siding companies and was referred to one well-established company in Grand Rapids that has sided a number of historic homes throughout Grand Rapids. I have spoken with the company owner and he assured me that my house can be sided in a manner that looks just like the original wood siding. It will be a complex and expensive job but after 30 years of external disrepair, the house will finally look as it should look.
- 8/6/2023 - Today, I contacted Sharon Carlson to ask if she knew any history about painting issues related to the exterior of my house. Sharon is a Stuart area homeowner, historian, and was a longtime chairperson of the Stuart Historic Area (where my house is located). This is what Sharon texted back to me regarding my house: “I know Paula Jamison and her husband Frank owned the house with his first wife (not Paula) and a year ago we were talking about the neighborhood. She mentioned that Frank had owned the house in the 1970s and practically the next words that came out of her mouth were that no paint ever adhered to the house. Sadly, Frank passed away about two years ago.”

Jeanne has got in touch with a couple contractors, and some won't work with her because it's a Historic Home. She did get in touch with Blackberry, and they were willing to work with her and would work with a painter for the more decorative areas. Ms. Underwood is curious about other options like hardy board or composite and the contractor stated this product would stick out too far on the corners and wouldn't look right. Mr. Johnson was curious about replacing all the wood siding, but Jeanne stated that the cost was not in her price range to even consider. Mr. Greyson states that the commission would need much more detail before they can decide. Mr. Greyson made a motion to postpone the application to the next meeting so that the applicant can supply more information regarding details, options, other materials, and textures with a second by Mr. Johnson. All commissioners approve to postpone.

VII. Commissioners Comments: Regarding 922 S Park and 904 S Park St

Ms. Underwood has received comments regarding some work at these properties.

922 S Park Egress window to be installed.

Letters to be sent to new owners of properties making them aware that work on the property needs to be reviewed either by the Historic Preservation Coordinator or the Historic District commission. Unsure if letters were received by owners or taxpayers in both situations.

904 S Park replaced decking and stairs on the property. Will have them fill out an application. Can always check the work being done can be checked on the building permit application but this work did not require an actual building permit. If there isn't structural work being performed, no building permit is needed.

Sally Reynolds is a guest with a comment, wants to verify if letters should be posted on the house when work is being done. Letters are sent to homeowners along with a sign that indicates work was approved. These signs are not required by ordinance, however, to be posted.

VIII. Coordinators Report: Information in packet

IX. Adjournment

Motion made to adjourn the meeting by Mr. Grayson with a second by Ms. Breisach. Meeting adjourned at 6:43 PM.

Chairperson

Date

Historic Preservation Coordinator

Date

Recording secretary

Date

